

Book Reviews

Monica Brînzei, Christopher Schabel (eds.), *The Cistercian James of Eltville († 1393). Author in Paris and Authority in Vienna*, (Studia Sententiarum, 3), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018, 501 p., ISBN 978-2-503-58188-0.

The recently published volume dedicated to the Cistercian monk James of Eltville is one of the results of a broader research regarding the development of theology at European universities, especially in Paris, during the Late Middle Ages, which generated several projects all having in common not just the topic, but also more or less the same team involving mostly early- and mid-career scholars concerned with medieval philosophy, under the guidance of one or both editors of the current volume. Especially two grants (the *THESIS* ERC starting-grant and the project *Philosophy and Theology in Cistercian Commentaries on the Sentences* financed by the Romanian National Authority for Scientific Research) supported the labour of this book, which gathers contributors from the Babeş-Bolyai University of Cluj-Napoca, IRHT Paris, the University of Cyprus, the University of Wisconsin-Madison and the Catholic University of America. Their endeavour is aimed at retracing the “intellectual journey of the Cistercian James of Eltville”, relaying) mostly on his commentary on the *Sentences* of Peter Lombard. Although his sole academic work, it held the attention of the authors of this volume as it survived in about twenty-five manuscripts, making it one of the most popular texts of the genre in the second half of the fourteenth century and, therefore, a relevant case study.

Throughout the twelve papers and a comprehensive introduction two main objectives can be distinguished: to set the context and historical features of this work’s emergence and influence, and to analyze its doctrinal content. The introduction signed by Christopher Schabel together with the contributions of William Courtney and Monica Brînzei put emphasis on the production and diffusion of James of Eltville’s work, the academic milieu in which he lectured on the *Sentences* and the subsequent transmission of the text, all correlated with previous historiographical achievements. By investigating all the witnesses preserved and several related sources, as well as by looking at them from a fresh perspective, using the tools of codicology,

palaeography, textual and historical criticism, quite a good amount of novelties are added to the profile of the Cistercian. The mentioned papers provide a reconstruction of Eltville's biography, of his company and his role in Paris, clarifications regarding the manuscript traditions. A worth mentioning contribution is the thorough investigation of the manuscripts assigned as *Lectura Eberbachensis*, based on which the commentary of the Cistercian was also ascribed to Henry of Langenstein. It is now demonstrated that such an attribution was erroneous, two plausible explanations being formulated in this respect, one of which is convincingly presented here by Courtney, the other one (questioned by Courtney, but not rejected) being previously published by Brînzei. Equally significant is the recovery of a lost part of Eltville's work, the *Principia*, a far less explored type of texts, mainly due to the scarce surviving materials, which makes Brînzei's detective work even more valuable. In the same group of papers with a more historical approach can be included the joint study of Monica Brînzei and Ioana Curuț, dealing with the impact of James of Eltville towards later theologians, expressively described as his transformation "from author to authority". This concluding chapter provides evidence regarding the use of Eltville's text as a source of inspiration through two case studies – Thomas Ebendorfer of Hasselbach and Pieter Reicher of Pirchenwart –, thus supplementing the proofs delivered by Courtney and Schabel on his influence on Nicolas of Dinkelsbühl, Marsilius of Inghen and a Dominican active in Basel in the late fourteenth century. Perhaps in the future it would also be worth taking a look at the contexts in which the preserved manuscripts were copied and used, an analysis that might prove fruitful in tracing further clues regarding the reception and importance of Eltville's work.

The second aim is achieved through the rest of the papers that offer a thorough analysis of the content of James of Eltville's *Sentences* commentary. The investigation focuses mainly on the Prologue and Book I, with some observations regarding Books II and IV. However, the papers are not arranged so as the analysis follows the order of the questions on the *Sentences*, but rather thematically, in a way in which almost each author's conclusions or remarks are somewhat further developed or questioned in the subsequent chapter. By doing so, Eltville's theological standpoint is uncovered step by step. As each paper deals with a different topic (the intension and remission of accidental form, the epistemological status of theology/theology as a scientific disposition, God's existence, God's will, Divine knowledge and foreknowledge, free will, predestination), each has its own identity and brings its own contributions, so that each could be subject to a separate discussion. Although different in this respect and at times unequal (but not imbalanced) in terms of lengthiness and intentions,

they share some common concerns, which will be emphasized here as red threads and main acquisitions of the volume.

One frequently mentioned issue towards which the contributors are turning their attention to is the way in which medieval authors constructed their texts. Such a discussion adds to the extensively debated topic of originality of medieval texts, as Eltville is a great example for the so-called *bricolage textuel*, supporting the argument that this intellectual practice cannot be simply labelled as plagiarism. Tracing the sources used by James of Eltville was one of the main tasks of the research project and an endeavour roughly common to all studies comprised in this volume. A direct contribution of this type of investigation is an expansion of the list of scholastic authorities on which Eltville based his arguments, revealing that beside John Hiltalingen of Basel – whose influence was previously emphasized by Damasus Trapp – and more than him, the Cistercian author used the works of Alphonsus Vargas of Toledo, Thomas of Strasbourg, Gregory of Rimini, Adam Wodeham, John of Mirecourt, Pierre Cheffons. Secondly, it becomes clear that the *Sentences* commentary of the Cistercian is not just an assemblage of passages copied from various authorities. The construction of an argument involved a selection of what was considered to be valuable, appropriate or convincing, the material was sometimes modified, integrated in new contexts and a simple juxtaposition of two phrases could alter their original meaning, generating originality or, at least, offering the author's personal point of view. Moreover, various contributions comprised in the volume invite to reflect on the way in which authors related to their sources – explicitly citing them, making references to a text one only knew through another author, not mentioning a main source of inspiration at all etc. – and the different manners of using these sources (copying verbatim, paraphrasing, resuming an argument etc.), both as deliberate choices and as mirrors of different stages of reception of a certain authority. Daniel Coman outstandingly illustrates this aspect, through the case study of Anselm of Canterbury's reception in the second half of the fourteenth century, his merit being especially that of supplementing the analysis with a theoretical frame and a historical approach.

More than an analysis of Eltville's ideas and contributions, the volume succeeds to retrace scholarly networks, connecting different parts of Europe – an aspect waiting to be further explored, relevant both for medieval history and for the history of ideas. All the contributions are aiming at offering a better understanding of the development of theology in Paris, during the second half of the fourteenth century. On a first level, every author is interested in elucidating Eltville's approach of various ardent

issues of debate and establishing his position within the main theories and traditions. But sometimes the figure of the Cistercian remains in the background, as he offers a pretext for an ampler discussion on the evolution of and interactions between these traditions, through an investigation of the influence authors exerted on each other. Various levels and types of intellectual connections and exchanges are taken into consideration, for instance: the reception of English theology in Paris, the influence of Augustinians towards Cistercians, concerns and positions of authors of the same order, the importance of the German group in Paris and its further impact towards the Viennese theology etc. Therefore, the volume manages to clarify or at least to offer insights into this rather nebulous phase of the medieval existence of the Parisian Faculty of Theology, left aside by many researches concentrating on the more spectacular twelfth and thirteenth centuries, as well as on its relevance for the establishment and development of Central European theology studies. In fact, the contributions in this book are also valuable from the perspective of the history of medieval universities, all human and intellectual connections emphasized here being essential components of the academic life. Eltville's work itself appears as a bridge between the University of Paris and the Viennese theology school, both as a key figure of the German group of scholars in Paris – probably the mentor to many of them, as William Courtney argues – and as a source of inspiration for those teaching in Vienna.

Therefore, the “controversial question” put forward by Christopher Schabel in the introduction – “why should we edit or even write about a text that is largely derivative of other works?” – finds an answer. The case study of James of Eltville's work illustrates, once again, that what was chosen to be copied and recycled in a new text tells a lot about its author's options and another's legacy, helps determine trends, points towards who was influential enough to generate them and who shared the same views.

If this are accomplishments of the volume in terms of content, its structure deserves some words as well. Although a collective volume, it has the coherence of a monograph, becoming clear that it is an organic result of common concerns, a collaborative research, and collective debates. While each paper preserves its own individuality, being sufficiently explanatory regarding the general context and features of Eltville's work, all the contributions fit together very well, are arranged probably in the best possible order, complementing each other and offering a gradual immersion into the academic path and work of the Cistercian. Quite striking is the absence of a separate part dedicated to conclusions, which would have rounded the volume by reviewing the topical issues, summarizing the core features of Eltville's work and highlighting the next steps to be done, even

though the introduction itself sums up the main idea of each study and the last paper comprises some concluding considerations. Absent as well in the book is a bibliographical list, but it does exist and a link is provided for accessing it – an innovative solution. If one might argue that in this manner the book becomes to some extent dependent of an electronic device and an internet connection, its “physical” absence is counterbalanced by including an *Index Nominorum (Post 1800)*, helping the reader to retrace the cited authors and places in the book where they were mentioned, while the primary sources can be detected via two other sets of indices: *Index manuscriptorum* and *Index Nominorum (Ante 1800)*.

To conclude, the volume proves itself consistent with the targeted objectives of the projects conducted by this international team. Moreover, it demonstrates that the projects were successful in bringing together experienced researchers and PhD students. While the first ones prove their expertise, making use of acquisition from previous or on-going researches, establishing interesting connections and comparisons, therefore, managing to provide an integrative view, the papers of young researchers are also of a very good quality, showing their acquaintance with the vast secondary literature and with the required methodology. The result is a book which can be of great use for those working on medieval texts, on medieval theology and philosophy, on the history of medieval universities and on intellectual history in general.

Paula COTOI

George Bariþiu Institute of History, Romanian Academy

Agnes Fischer – Dardai, Istvan Lengvari, Eva Schmelczer – Pohanka (eds.), *University and Universality. The Place and Role of the University of Pécs in Europe from the Middle Ages to Present Day*, (A Pecs Egyetemi Konyvtar Kiadvanyai, 16), Pécs, 2017, 394 p., ISBN: 978-963-429-191-6, DOI: 10.15170/pte650.lib.2017.

The 650th anniversary of the foundation of the first Hungarian university occasioned various events and publications in 2017, among which the book reviewed now. The collective volume presents the proceedings of an international conference with the same title, organized during the 12th and 13th October 2017 by the University Library of Pécs and the Centre for Learning of the same university, together with the Department of Medieval and Early Modern History of the Faculty of Humanities and the University

of Pécs Archives. The colloquium managed to create a dialogue between Hungarian researchers and academics from Switzerland, Austria, Romania, Poland and Slovakia.

The volume is structured into five sections, with a total of nineteen papers in English and German, preceded by a preface and the opening lectures of the conference held by József Bódis, the rector of the University of Pécs, György Udvardy, bishop of Pécs, and the general director of the University Library of Pécs, Agnes Fischer-Dardai. As one of the editors, Fischer-Dardai also signed the very brief preface, which offers some details regarding the conference and acknowledges the contribution of all the institutions and people involved in organizing the event and publishing the volume. Beside some language deficiencies, this introductory part neglects exposing the intentions, objectives, the structure and the merits of the volume. Thus, the reader can only deduce the concept that guided this scientific event and its subsequent written outcome. A conclusive text is also missing.

The first section, comprising the plenary lectures offered by Christian Hesse (Switzerland) and Laszlo Szögi (Hungary), substitutes to some extent an introduction, setting a theoretical and methodological frame and discussing the past and perspectives of research in the field of university history. Hesse refers especially to the German research, systematically assessing the different trends influenced by the various "turns" in historiography, as well as the challenges implied by the use of new technologies, with emphasis on the research project *Repertorium Academicum Germanicum*. Correspondingly, Laszlo Szögi offers a synthesis of Hungarian achievements in the field, highlighting the topics which aroused a special interest (*peregrinatio academica*, the foundation of Hungarian universities, the history of other institutions of higher education, especially confessional colleges) and important source editions, monographs and studies. As most of them were published in Hungarian, this thorough presentation in German provides a wider access to their main contributions.

A second section is dedicated to the medieval beginnings of the University of Pécs through four papers that are questioning the context, conditions and premises of this (unsuccessful) foundation in 1367. While Marta Font (Hungary), after a quite long and general introduction (her starting question being "what is a university?"), summarizes the available data regarding the foundation and the short-term activity of all medieval Hungarian universities (Pécs, Obuda and Bratislava), attempting to explain why they ceased to function, Tamás Fedeles (Hungary) provides a more specific and analytical study, focusing only on the University of Pécs. His paper comprises what the title claims, a short history of this university,

thoroughly discussing the topical and sometimes controversial aspects (motivations, intellectual and financial background of the foundation, profile of the founder, staff and curriculum, location, and the moment of its closure) based on various sources, from Papal charters, to archaeological material. Each of the two subsequent papers attempts to bring further in-depth details regarding one aspect in particular of the medieval history of this institution. Miklos Boda (Hungary) briefly examines concerns for education of a previous bishop of Pécs, Nicholas of Neszmély (bishop between 1346-1364), as possible clues of an older interest for establishing a university or at least as good premises for the later *studium generale*. Peter Haraszti Szabo (Hungary) intends to make an addition to the short list of the professors known to have been active there. His bold study systematically collects various pieces of evidence - a demanding task, as the parsimony of sources is a *topos* of researches on this topic - that might support the hypothesis that John of Prague, a famous professor at the Faculty of Arts of the University of Prague, also taught in Pécs.

The Hungarian borders are surpassed within the third section of the volume, comprising four papers as well. Their common ground seems to be the university studies in medieval Central and Eastern Europe, a special concern being that of *peregrinatio academica*. The articles signed by István Draskóczy (Hungary) and Borbála Kelény (Hungary) investigate the presence of Hungarian students in Vienna and Krakow, two popular destinations in the Late Middle Ages, both making use extensively of statistical analysis. A different approach is undertaken by Adinel C. Dincă (Romania), whose paper demonstrates how research of medieval books is able to provide new data for retracing the university studies and, a far more neglected issue, the subsequent careers of former students, the particular case of those originating in Transylvania being examined here. Although the first in this section, the paper of Kurt Mühlberger (Austria) shall be discussed towards the end of this paragraph, as it is somehow incongruent with those presented above. While it also deals with the history of a Central European institution, i.e. the University of Vienna, it is mostly a synthesis of the historiography concerning the subject and an evaluation of sources and methods involved by the Austrian research in the field. In this respect, this paper has more in common with the studies of Krzysztof Ozóg (Poland) and Mária Grófová (Slovakia), comprised in the fourth part of the volume, questioning the same issues in what concerns the history of the University of Krakow and the Slovakian historiography (in essence a bibliography for each institution of higher education in Slovakia).

Not just the medieval period was of interest for scholars attending the conference. A fourth section gathers precisely the contributions regarding "higher education from the early modern period to present days", while from a thematic point of view they cover a wide range of topics. Beside the already mentioned historiographical studies, five others are dealing with specific aspects of the history of education in Hungary. István Monok's (Hungary) declared intention is to investigate the "specialized libraries" (*Fachbibliotheken*), but the result is an essay-like paper regarding the history of libraries with an accent on their specific in the sixteenth to eighteenth centuries. The Hungarian contributions to pedagogy during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries are examined by András Németh (Hungary), highlighting the main characteristics of various phases in the development of education sciences in Hungary. The University of Pécs comes again into discussion due to István Lengvári (Hungary) and Petra Polyák (Hungary). The first one is concerned with the professors activating here between 1923 and 1950, emphasizing the potential of a database recently created by the University Archives, while Polyák explores the role of jubilees celebrated in the twentieth century in fashioning the institution's identity and the different narratives about its (discontinuous) history. The last paper within this section offers a reflexive view upon current trends in higher education, Csilla Stéger (Hungary) discussing key evolutions of the last decades, such as the Bologna Process or the increase of proportion of young adults with a tertiary degree, presenting as well the results of an enquire about the future of universities.

The last section sends us back in time with two papers dealing with libraries which functioned in conjunction with institutions of higher education. A separate section dedicated to this topic is justified, as books were essential instruments of instruction, while now they can be valuable historical sources. Still, this might not have been the criterion in this case, since two earlier papers explored issues related to book and library history and are not included in this group. It seems that this solution was rather motivated by the institutional affiliation of the two authors, Éva Schmelczer-Pohánka (Hungary) and Ágnes Fischer-Dárdai (Hungary), both working at the University Library of Pécs. However, their papers created together a coherent narrative about the history, content and function of book collections and libraries which served the needs of different institutions involved in education in Pécs, from the Middle Ages up to the twentieth century.

To sum up, a global evaluation reveals that the volume does not appear to be very well articulated. Judging by the titles of the sections, the whole book seems coherent, but paying attention to each part as it stands,

some papers are rather incongruent. This is of course an editorial matter, which remains a minor fault, especially given that collective volumes are rarely read cover to cover. Regardless of their arrangement in sections, the papers resolve some important issues. Even though the Hungarian contribution is a substantial one, the volume succeeds to surpass, from various points of view, a strictly regional or local approach, which often places such works in the area of an unconstructive provincialism with limited vision and impact. Thematically, the subject of the history of European universities between the fourteenth and the twentieth centuries was explored, allowing the discussion of broader contexts in which the Hungarian situation or the different specific cases from Central and Eastern Europe can be integrated. Such an intention can be retraced both within the studies regarding the University of Pécs and those referring to other Hungarian institutions. Equally beneficial is the publication of the papers in English and German, enabling a larger access inclusively to previous researches written in less approachable languages and which are sometimes summarized or debated here. Of course, as in many collective volumes, papers are unequal, but overall, they manage to systematize the existing research directions of the history of universities in Central and Eastern Europe. Moreover, the various contributions of the University History Research Group, established within the Eötvös Loránd University in Budapest, as well as the historiographical studies prove that university history is not just an occasional concern, revived by jubilees, but an active field, constantly developing its methods and working-tools, at present highly benefiting of the opportunities provided by new technologies.

Paula COTOI

George Barițiu Institute of History, Romanian Academy

Markus Friedrich, *Die Jesuiten Aufstieg Niedergang Neubeginn*, Verlag Piper, Munchen Berlin Zurich 2016, ISBN: 9783492055390, p. 736

Markus Friedrich is a good knower of the Jesuit history during the Early Modern Era. Nonetheless, this book represents a huge challenge for the academia and readers, as it has a generous and informative approach, over 400 hundred years of history. The author describes the history of this order from the very beginnings, when Ignace of Loyola funded it until the

election of the first Jesuit pope, Pope Francis. The book encompasses a variety of topics and provides the reader with basic but comprehensive information on the organisation and internal order of the Societas, piety within the after Trent Era and its contribution to the Counter-Reformation, involvement in the European politics, society and culture, development and actions in the colonial world, and not at last, conversion missions, internal controversies, critics and animosities against the Jesuits, the abolishment of the order (1773) and the reorganisation after 1814. Not surprisingly, the nineteenth and twentieth century are rather presented in a resume, as the Hamburg scholar is indeed a specialist of Early Modern History. Moreover, we must take into account that the role of the Jesuits was totally different from the previous two centuries.

There is hardly a topic not addressed or mentioned by the author and for a good knower of the Jesuit history, a large part of the information is not new. Thus, any reader would be curious to find out whether the author of this book can bring some fresh information or new approach on this topic. Undoubtedly, he does! As an expert of the archives, communication, circulation and compiling of *litterae annuae*, Markus Friedrich understands how to interpret and decipher the Jesuit sources. To a large extent, the rich and relevant information collected by Markus Friedrich originates in German, English Italian, Spanish and French written articles and books, which may trigger into question, are the Dutch or Czech written contributions meaningless for the Jesuit history in Early Modern Europe? Nonetheless, the approach of Markus Friedrich is original and analytical, with plenty of empirical examples, which denote that this book is indeed the outcome of a personal research and reflexion. Thus, after presenting the biography of Ignace in a very contextual manner, the author describes how the order was funded, the importance of the social networks which contributed to the development of the Jesuits, the core of their organisation and the building of a Jesuit identity, the so called group self-conscience: constitutions, Ignatius model coupled with hagiographic treats and relations describing the activity of the Jesuit settlements. Markus Friedrich correctly notices that internal conflicts were not rare, deviation and alienation occurred, meanwhile the examples provided by the author are manifold. A fresh reminder brought into discussion by the author is the position of the Jesuits within the Roman Church, thus stressing out or better written, cancelling some incorrect perceptions about the Jesuits: we may see that their relationship to the pontifical organisations, involvement within the

inquisition or their support provided to the propaganda fide in Rome was far away from total subordination. As expected, a generous attention is given to the spiritual care and relationship to the Protestants, where we may recognise traditional perceptions about the Jesuit practices and spiritual activities, but in parallel we may also observe the other face of the Jesuits, their implication into the spiritual care of the sinners, such as prostitutes or convicted prisoners. As concerns their role in the Counter-Reformation, less discussed by the author are the limits of the successes, as their strategies against the confessional adversaries highly differed from Catholic Bavaria or Flanders to Bohemia, the Hanseatic region or Transylvania. Thus, although the author notices that the two main strategies, i.e. force and persuasion co-existed and in certain places, the Jesuits had to be cautious and moderate, Markus Friedrich is less focussed on the fact that the accommodation to the local context was crucial for the conversion and furthermore, by missing strong political and military support, the success was limited, as the author himself showed us in his brilliant study about the Catholics and Lutherans of Hamburg during the Early Modern Era¹.

Until nowadays, the conspiracy role of the Jesuits affects their image and inspires many authors and unfortunately even theologians. On the other side, this negative image is sometimes more neglected by the Jesuit authors². By contrast to this, Markus Friedrich as a secular historian with strong analytic skills and by means of manifold examples, depicts a more realistic image. Thus, he shows us that the Jesuits had generous patrons and supporters and despite the poverty ideal, they accumulated properties, dealt with money and were involved in economic activities. At the same time, they could have also fiscal obligations and they criticised the accumulation of fortunes. The involvement of the Jesuits in politics is scrutinised by the author by considering the epoch climax, the personality of the fathers and the social circumstances. Thus, we may follow the differences between practice and theory, the real political achievements and failures of the Jesuits, all contextually described by the author in a cursive way and with plenty of examples. The same analysis style is applied when Markus Friedrich

¹ Markus Friedrich. "Jesuiten und Lutheraner im frühneuzeitlichen Hamburg. Katholische Seelsorge im Norden des Alten Reichs zwischen Konversionen, Konfessionskonflikten und interkonfessionellen Kontakten". *Zeitschrift des Vereins für Hamburgische Geschichte* (2018): 1-78.

² For instance William V. Bangert S.J.

approaches the Jesuit involvement in the education, science, culture and art: from vanguard to decadence, the Jesuits underwent through different stages. They contributed to the development of a modern educational and research system, which targeted the formation of intellectual elites. Nevertheless, by selecting only some academic centres, the author omits the fact that the splendour of the Jesuit educational network highly depended on the recruiting possibility and local support, which in some cases was quite deficient, due to the political, social and confessional conjuncture. Another important chapter of the book is dedicated to the global expansion of the Jesuits, a topic which benefited of interest during the last decades. Thus, Markus Friedrich presents the Jesuit expansion in the different parts of the world with many details which explain the general evolution. We may see what their major challenges in Asia and in the New World were, how they approached slavery, and by which means they converted a part of the heathens. Furthermore, the author presents the impact as well of their *litterae* in Europe, the importance of the Jesuit description model.

The last part of the book is dedicated to the abolition and re-establishment of the order. It is a concise presentation, meant to show the reader what was the context, how the Jesuits were perceived by the contemporaries and why were they abolished: their perception as despotic monarchy acting in the interest of foreign powers, their morality or backwardness (according to the enlightened philosophy). The re-establishment of the order is analysed concisely, Markus Friedrich presents the major trends and discusses the latest evolution until the election of Pope Francisc. All in all, this is a book rich in information and well documented, accessible for both common readers, theologians and historians. It gives us a very clear view on the evolution of this order, who intensively contributed to the evolution of the Early Modern society. Furthermore, it may change the common view of the readers about the Jesuits, in order to better understand the Jesuit history.

Sever OANCEA

Ph.D. student, University of Frankfurt

Katrin Keller, Petr Mat'a, Martin Scheutz (Ed.): *Adel und Religion in der frühneuzeitlichen Habsburgermonarchie*, Böhlau Verlag Wien, 2019, ISBN 978-3-205-20390-2, p. 388.

This volume is dedicated to Professor Thomas Winkelbauer, an exegete of the Habsburg Monarchy during the Early Modern Era. Nobles and Confession was one of the mostly addressed topics by this author during the last decades and therefore almost every researcher who approaches these topics will come across the studies carried out by the reputed Viennese scholar. It is also the case for the authors of this volume, who continue to a high extent the work of Thomas Winkelbauer.

The volume covers the entire Early Modern Era by also crossing the borders of the eighteenth century and all the three parts of the Habsburg Monarchy, i.e. the Austrian lands, Bohemia and Hungary. The authors approached many topics addressed by Thomas Winkelbauer, nobles and confessionalization, piety, conversion but also other themes related to the nobles and religion. Unlike other volumes, we are missing here an introduction where to be discussed the core terms of the Early Modern Era, as this is sometimes carried out in the articles of the authors. Moreover, the usage of the term *gesamtösterreichisch* nobles would have required further explanations, can we really refer to an Austrian nobility, while dealing with Hungary or even Transylvania or Croatia? What is the meaning of this term?

The article of Josef Hrdlička approaches the Protestant confessionalization in Bohemia and Moravia (1520-1620) by analysing the influence of the nobles in promoting the Lutheran regulations. Istvan Fazekas brings into discussion a less known part of Hungarian Catholicism, the persistence of Catholicism in Eastern Hungary. He focusses on a few noble families and highlights the importance of marriage, policy, education and patronage in preserving the old faith in a Calvinist milieu by also sketching out certain limits. Alessandro Catalano addresses the Bohemian diet of 1615 with its implications, meanwhile Geza Palfy brings into discussion the importance of Sopron as a crowning town. Marie-Elisabeth Ducreux describes the catholicization role of the Putz family (Bohemia), by analysing a forgotten diary and stressing out the promotion of the cult of saints. Arno Strohmeier presents the I construction in the correspondence of Alexander von Greiffenklau, an Austrian diplomat in Istanbul. Herewith the author shows how the diplomat understood his role, by mainly stressing out

the Christian dimension of his identity. Elisabeth Garms-Cornides addresses the issue of noble's pilgrimage in Rome, meanwhile Martin Scheutz discusses the confessionalization again, by stressing out also the confessional function of the hospitals. Friedrich Polleroß refers to noble's involvement in developing the sacral art during the Baroque Era, a less researched topic in the Habsburg Monarchy. Andras Forgo addresses the late confessionalization in Hungary, a study good to remind us that the timeframe of the Reinhardt paradigm may be pushed to a certain extent until late in the eighteenth century, as Martin Scheutz or Andreas Holzem already pointed out in the past. Olga Khavanova addresses the conversions to Catholicism in the Teresian Era, a topic less discussed in the literature and stresses out that conversions were still important at the Court, although the conversion literature disappeared. William D. Godsey describes the anti-jewish initiatives of the Ritterstand (1808), a topic which highlights the limits of the tolerance by the beginning of the nineteenth century.

Undoubtedly, this volume continues and develops the work of Thomas Winkelbauer and it has a big value for the current research evolution in Central Europe. We may trace the major research trends, but also the historiography gaps, as for instance Transylvania. On the one hand, we may see that some authors used more secondary literature, which raises the question of new interpretations, but it can also stimulate historians to go back to archives and library manuscripts. On the other hand, we may notice how important the sources are, nobles can be studied through different perspectives and by means of manifold sources (diaries, correspondence, regulations or art representation). Nevertheless, as the articles are written in German, French or Italian, a summary in English would have been more than welcome, in order to facilitate the information access to a broader publicum.

Sever OANCEA

Ph.D. student, University of Frankfurt

Marina Soroka, *The Summer Capitals of Europe, 1814-1919*. Routledge, London and New York, 2017, viii, 342 p. ISBN: 978-0-415-79245-5

Marina Soroka has solid knowledge of European nineteenth-century diplomacy and aristocracy, focusing on the Russian aristocracy and its ties with Europe. Over the last years she has published several books on the topic: *Britain, Russia, and the road to the First World War. The fateful embassy of Count*

Aleksandr Benckendorff (1903-16) (Farnham, Surrey, England; Burlington, VT, Ashgate, 2011); *Письма (1918-1940) к княгине А.А. Оболенской / Императрица Мария Федоровна, Великая княгиня Ольга Александровна, Великая княгиня Ксения Александровна*. Edition by Marina Soroka (Moskva, Izdatel'stvo im. Sabashnikovykh, Universitet Dmitriia Pozharskogo, 2013); in collaboration with Charles A. Ruud, *Becoming a Romanov: Grand Duchess Elena of Russia and her world (1807-1873)* (Farnham, Surrey, Ashgate, 2015). Her interest in the history of aristocracy, international relations, and last but not least her familiarity with important archival funds of Russian aristocratic families and with epistolary and memorialist sources, are some of the prerequisites of the present book.

The Summer Capitals of Europe, 1814-1919 is a history of European aristocracy, but also a history of European diplomacy envisaged from a less usual perspective: that of the spas where, suffering from real or imaginary diseases, the aristocracy, the princely, royal and imperial families, and all high-class people in general used to spend their summers. Spas were a true "institution"! One can thus state that the book contains in fact three monographs: one of aristocracy – one of diplomacy – and one of spas, approached from the perspective of social history.

The spas envisaged by Marina Soroka are spas, mountain or seaside resorts, some with a tradition of centuries, others recently created during the nineteenth century. They were attractive through their mineral waters with curative properties, the fresh air, the natural landscape, the atmosphere, and the social life. For a long while they were the privilege of aristocracy and of other prosperous social categories but during the nineteenth century one notes the enlargement of the social origin of those who frequented the spas, in parallel with the consolidation of the middle class and the development of railway transportation. This was a process of "democratization" through which the aristocracy lost its exclusivity in attending the spas. Not by chance, the author's research envisages the period 1815-1919, between the fall of Napoleon and the reorganization of Europe through the Congress of Vienna and until the end of the Great War. This was the golden age of modern aristocracy and the golden age of spas and seaside resorts.

The topic of spas, mountain and seaside resorts was most often approached from the perspective of the history of travel, tourism, medicine, and even economy, but less from the perspective of social history and this is in fact one of the main novelties of the book. The *Introduction* (p. 1-10) very clearly explains this social approach.

The work is logically structured, from the general issue of spas, organically flowing towards aspects related to the history of European diplomacy in 1815-1919 that are the book's center of weight.

The main actors of the book are European aristocrats and the European princely, royal, and imperial families, from Spain and France to Russia and Bulgaria. During the era when the manner of making politics went through significant changes (political decision making passed from monarchs and their councilors to the governments), the aristocracy continued to control at least one branch of government: diplomacy. During this period Europe did not experience continental wars, only local conflicts (the Austrian-Prussian Wars, the Franco-German War, the Russian-Turkish War, the War of Crimea, the 1848-1849 Revolutions), so the life of the aristocracy was predictable and followed a predictable annual calendar (p. 1-2). Also, European aristocracy was cosmopolitan *par excellence*, tied through numerous friendship, family and social relations, and the aristocrats also practiced these strong ties during the summers, at the spas, including through activities that were diplomatic in nature: (...) because the European diplomatic network functioned within the transnational aristocratic network (...) (p. 2-5, the paragraph quoted from p. 2). The author often makes reference to Russian aristocracy and clearly shows its extremely close family ties basically with the entire aristocratic and royal Europe. The diplomats of the long nineteenth century, almost exclusively raised from among the ranks of the aristocracy, lived in the same social and intellectual universe, had similar visions, and fulfilled their diplomatic assignments using the same instruments. These are the starting assumptions of the book *Summer capitals*.

Going to the spa, part of the lifestyle of aristocracy, of their routine, of their annual calendar, was one of the (...) *socially unifying rituals of aristocratic society* (p. 1) and is the key in which one must read the history of European aristocracy and, implicitly, the history of European diplomacy, as long as diplomacy was preponderantly practiced by aristocrats. Hence the very inspired title of the book: *The Summer Capitals of Europe*. Diplomatic activities (from spying activities, harmless discussions on the resort's promenade, to the negotiation of secret military treatises) moved during the summers from the state capitals to the spas and the presence of some royal or imperial celebrity ensured the success of a season and the prestige of a resort.

The first part of the book is entitled *Spa life* (p. 11-114) and follows, on a theoretical level and through numerous examples, life at the spas, mountain or seaside resorts, from a social perspective.

Chapter 1 *Shrines-Springs-Spas* (p. 13-38) focuses on the history of using thermal waters as a cure, between Antiquity and the beginning of the twentieth century. The authors stress the social aspects and the way people

spent their time at the spas, namely with medical treatments, means of socializing, food, walks, trips, music, and landscape. Chapter 2 *Therapy vs Pleasure* (p. 39-64) follows the gradual transformation of the spas from places destined exclusively to medical treatments to places of leisure and entertainment. Employing a rich documentary material, mainly from the aristocratic world, the authors discuss several of the era's representative spas: Abbazia, Aix-les-Bains, Bad Kissingen, Bad Kreuznach, Baden-Baden, Karlsbad, Marienbad, Ostende, Vichy, Wiesbaden, besides the numerous seaside resorts on the Italian and French Riviera. One of the factors that contributed to these evolutions is the development of the railway system, as people traveled quicker and more comfortably from the great capitals to the summer capitals. If, for example, in 1840 the trip from Paris to Marseille took 8 days, in 1876 it took 16 hours; during the same era, five trains left daily from the train stations of Paris to Vichy, one of France's most prestigious spas (p. 43-44). Another aspect specific to spas during the era of the great transformations of the social origin of visitors is the development of the grand hotels (p. 45-48).

Royal patronage was the first step to success for a spa. It is the well-known case of King Edward VII of Great Britain who frequented for years the spa in Marienbad, of emperor Napoleon III of France and empress Eugenie, strenuous visitors of the French spas of Plombières and Eaux-Bonnes, respectively, of Franz Joseph whose summer capital was Bad Ischl (p. 59-61, the starting phrase is quoted from p. 59). The summer season could start early, with the arrival of some illustrious figure, or could be prolonged into the autumn if the celebrities extended their stay at the resort.

Chapter 3 *Spa Society* (p. 65-89) deals with the articulation of the means of socialization at the spas and seaside resorts. There were, on the one hand, the aristocrats, the traditional visitors, and on the other hand the visitors part of social categories attracted precisely by the presence of the aristocracy and of members of the princely, royal and imperial families. This is the so-called invasion of the "tourists" that the aristocracy frowned upon and even despised. Even if during the nineteenth century the political and economic power of the aristocracy faded, it continued to be a model and to attract others like a magnet. The phenomenon is mostly visible at the spas and seaside resorts, where the hotels made their lists of visitors public and big names attracted visitors among the nouveaux rich and the middle classes, thus ensuring the prosperity of the hotels and, indirectly, of the spas (p. 67-69). The same resorts were the perfect place to hide romantic affairs, to set up marriages or even to hide (oneself) from politically or socially unpleasant situations (p. 78-83).

The fact that the spas moved away from their primary mission, that of providing treatments and curing the sick, is a result of the proliferation of gambling, a specific attribute of leisure, but also a cure against the boredom and routine of life at the spas (p. 97-99). This is the main focus of chapter 4 *Making Money out of Pleasure* (p. 90-114), that analyzes spas and seaside resorts through the perspective of the economic activities that brought development and progress to numerous settlements that had been anonymous villages or market towns until they became top destinations (p. 91). They attracted armies of servants, maids, cooks, physicians, businessmen, musicians, artists, writers, but also fortune and dowry hunters, gamblers, luxury prostitutes, and gigolos. A special category consists of journalists in search of both political information and juicy news. *Foreign ministers and ambassadors had their "pet" journalists to whom they fed information they wanted to become known* (p. 110).

The second part of the book is entitled *Business of Europe* (p. 115-316) and is dedicated to the history of diplomacy carried out in the pleasant context of the spas, mountain and seaside resorts. This part is the core of the book and it is here that the author fully displays her qualities of historian of both diplomacy and aristocracy. Chapter 5 *Royalty at Spas* (p. 117-142) follows the presence of crowned heads at spas. *Royalty's spa visits, like all their public appearances, fulfilled the ritual functions of monarchy: projecting a favourable image of the dynasty (...)* (p. 117), because not only the spas but also the monarchs themselves, together with their families (dynasties) benefited from these visits by gaining prestige. The author presents several well-known examples: queen Victoria of Great Britain at Nice and Aix-les-Bains, empress Eugenie of France at Eaux-Bonnes, emperor Franz Joseph at Bad Ischl, empress Alexandra of Russia on the Riviera (p. 118-123). The best-known example is that of king Edward VII of Great Britain's stays in Marienbad that have been the topic of an older monograph: Sigmund Muenz, *King Edward VII at Marienbad. Political and social life at the Bohemian spas* (London, Hutchinson & Co. 1934, 303 p., see also the German edition: Wien, 1934, 269 p.). Marina Soroka mentions sources according to which Edward VII's presence at Marienbad brought more than 20000 visitors at the spa, as the king set an entire fashion of visiting Marienbad that his English subjects followed ... (p. 127-133). The case of Edward VII, much discussed in the era's printed press and in the autobiographic works that the author employed, is a classic example of a monarch's diplomatic activity in his summer capital: the king strolled along the promenade, took part in fashionable events, received visits from other monarchs or political personalities, and returned their visits. For example, he received the visits of Franz Joseph and visited the latter in Bad Ischl, he received the French prime-

minister Georges Clemenceau and the Russian minister of the exterior, count Alexander Izvolsky, both traditional visitors of Karlsbad, and visited them both at the neighboring spa (p. 129-132). The repeated and informal visits of Great Britain's king with French and Russian politicians have perfected the English-French-Russian alliance, the future Entente during the First World War (p. 131-132).

A classic example of diplomacy practiced in the summer capitals is presented in Chapter 6 *Era of Congresses* (p. 143-170). After the fall of Napoleon and the completion of the Congress in Vienna (1815) that has set the bases of a new order in Europe, the great powers have also organized two ample conferences in Aix-la-Chapelle (Aachen) (1818) and Karlsbad (1819), consolidating the European power system developed by chancellor Klemens von Metternich. The next two chapters (*Looking after Europe* and *Secret Diplomacy*, p. 171-194, 195-223) deal with the gathering of information and secret diplomacy, respectively, in the summer capitals. Starting from the assumption that until the development of the modern post and telegraph services, the spas, mountain and seaside resorts were intersections where the Europeans met, socialized, and exchanged information, Marina Soroka shows how important information gathering was. The spas were ideal places from this perspective, as people were relaxed, willing to socialize and exchange information, among which significant data could slip (involuntarily or even on purpose!). The author stresses the fact that the information learned in front of the mineral water spring, on the promenade, or during trips were not of colossal significance, but helped one better understanding the interlocutor's political stands (p. 171-172). It was not by chance that those willing to obtain information paid attention to every word spoken at a reception or at a concert and to every gesture made during a theater show or while clinking glasses of Champaign.

The following chapters approach hard topics of diplomatic history, as they happened in the context of spas, mountain and seaside resorts: the French-German relations around the 1870-1871 War (p. 224-246), the involvement of chancellor Otto von Bismarck in the affairs of European diplomacy at the spas he frequented (Biarritz, Bad Gastein, Bad Kissingen) (p. 247-268), the French-Russian closeness and, respectively, the cooling of the Russian-German relations in the beginning of the twentieth century (p. 269-275). An interesting case is how Bulgarian diplomacy functioned at the spas (at Franzensbad, at Karlsbad, on the French Riviera, at Abbazia) during the reigns of princes Alexander von Battenberg (1879-1886) and Ferdinand of Saxa-Coburg (1908-1918) (p. 279-289), with a special view of the Bulgarian-Russian diplomatic relations.

The final chapter - *The Flight from Spas and the End of an Era: 1914-1919* (p. 295-316) is dedicated to the years of war that were a kind of epilogue to the great history of European diplomacy practice in the summer capitals. The author has an excellent approach of the start of the Great War, from the assassination in Sarajevo of Franz Ferdinand, the crown prince of Austro-Hungary, and his wife until the actual start of the military operations. She takes note of the manner in which the spas and their visitors became aware of the start of the war that was about to change not only the spa culture but the world itself. The final pages of the chapter focus on the year 1919 and the visitors returning to the spas, mountain and seaside resorts (p. 313-314). But, as Marina Soroka rightly noted, this was a different world: *The spa culture became obsolete. (...) Spas declined as a social venue because "society" in the old sense ceased to exist* (p. 313).

The book does not lack conclusions and a bibliography. The bibliography is ample (p. 321-334), impressive especially through the contemporary archival sources it includes. As I pointed out in the beginning of this book review, the author is familiar with the specific sources for the history of European aristocracy and the history of European diplomacy during the Modern Era, as this shows throughout the book and renders the analysis consistency.

I admit that Marina Soroka's book first appealed to me due to the history of spas, a topic that I am familiar with and interested in because in the recent years I have been researching the Romanian visitors of Karlsbad. The book offered me a general European-wide perspective on the phenomenon of spa going, of which Karlsbad is an important chapter. On the other hand, the attention she pays to the diplomacy practiced in the summer capitals and to its main actors - aristocrats, monarchs, and princely, royal and imperial families, offered me an interesting social and cultural perspective of the issue. Unfortunately, Romanians are barely mentioned in the book, but one can feel them, anonymous, in the background of the strolls along the promenade, of the receptions, of the balls, of the casual or less unintentional discussions, of the romantic adventures and of the searching for information that the author speaks about. Reading the book one can understand how strong and how complex were the mechanisms behind some of the political decisions of European significance, such as the connections of king Carol I of Romania with Germany and Austro-Hungary and the adoption of the decisions that Romania remain neutral (1914) and then join the war on the side of the Entente (1916).

Radu MÂRZA

Faculty of History and Philosophy, Babeş-Bolyai University

Translated by Ana-Maria Gruia

Iacob Mârza, *Zenovie Pâclişanu, contribuții la o monografie* [Zenovie Pâclişanu, contributi ad una monografia], Ediție de Radu Mârza, Editura Mega, Cluj-Napoca, 2017, 327 p.

Il compianto professor Iacob Mârza, spentosi prematuramente, ci ha lasciato quest'opera monografica su padre Zenovie Pâclişanu (1886-1957). Credo sia stata la sua ultima opera, curata da Radu Mârza, il figlio del docente universitario scomparso.

Un bel dono dato a noi, agli storici ed alla Chiesa Greco-cattolica che Padre Zenovie aveva servito e per cui si immolò nel 1957, offrendo la sua vita per Gesù e per la Chiesa greco-cattolica. Morì nel 1957, dopo essere stato torturato ed imprigionato. La sua *via crucis* ebbe come "stazioni" anche il terribile carcere di Sighet Marmatei e di Jilava.

Grazie al suo percorso scolastico, tratteggiato bene dal prof. Iacob Mârza, egli ebbe una buona preparazione culturale, religiosa e linguistica. Oltre alla lingua nativa, conosceva bene anche la lingua ungherese ed il tedesco. Ovviamente, non era alieno dal latino ciò che gli permise di accedere anche a documenti in questa lingua classica, grazie alla quale poté ben comprendere fonti storiche di cui si servì anche per le sue pubblicazioni.

Dopo essere stato imprigionato nel primo dopoguerra, fu liberato per breve tempo nel 1955, ma con l'incubo di essere ucciso, come aveva confidato alla sua amata moglie Hortensia³.

A quest'ultima dobbiamo essere grati, sempre secondo la testimonianza di Ioan Tîmbuş, per avere serbato il manoscritto della sua opera, forse la più conosciuta, *Istoria Bisericii Române Unite*, pubblicata parzialmente nella rivista "Bună Vestire" [La Buona Novella] a Roma e, in un secondo tempo, nella rivista "Perspective", diretta dal compianto mons. Octavian Bârlea⁴.

L'ultima edizione fu pubblicata dalla Casa Editrice Galaxia Gutenmërg, di Târgu Lăpuş, diretta da padre Silviu Hodiş.

Senza dubbio, padre Zenovie Pâclişanu fece onore non solo alla sua Chiesa, la Greco-cattolica romena, ma anche alla sua Patria, nel periodo universitario a Budapest ed a Vienna e poi nei congressi internazionali ove si distinse. Vorrei citare, solo per fare un esempio, la Conferenza Internazionale di Parigi.

³ Cfr. Ioan Tîmbuş, *Prefața la Ediția a treia*, in Zenovie Pâcleşanu, *Istoria Bisericii Române Unite*, Galaxia Gutenberg, Târgu Lăpuş, 2006, pp. 6-7.

⁴ *Ibidem*, p. 9.

Il suo destino fu segnato dai comunisti che ricambiarono con la reclusione e la tortura non solo i figli più semplici, ma anche i migliori, quelli che avevano illustrato la Patria e la cultura.

Sono grato alla signora Andreea Mârza che mi ha inviato il libro a cui anche lei ha collaborato; le sono grato perché mi è stato permesso di conoscere meglio la figura di questo ecclesiastico in un certo senso un po' atipico.

Sappiamo infatti che egli, pur essendo sacerdote della Chiesa greco-cattolica, si era occupato più di cultura, di pubblicistica che del suo mandato spirituale.

Al momento però in cui la Chiesa greco-cattolica iniziò ad essere perseguitata e poi ufficialmente soppressa con l'iniqua legge comunista che imitava quella della distruzione della Chiesa greco-cattolica ucraina, egli iniziò a occuparsi con solerzia della Sua Chiesa, divenendo, dopo la morte di Mons. Vasile Aftenie, avvenuta il 10 Maggio del 1950, suo successore nella clandestinità in qualità di vicario generale per il Vecchio Regno, ossia per i territori non-transilvani di cui aveva avuto cura il futuro beato Mons. Vasile Aftenie, sino a versare il proprio sangue per i suoi fedeli ed anche per tutti quelli che aspiravano alla libertà di coscienza ed al rispetto della propria dignità.

Quindi, dopo la distruzione della Chiesa greco-cattolica il pubblicista, bibliotecario, uomo di cultura, si mise a disposizione della Nunziatura apostolica di Bucarest.

Come il suo predecessore, anch'egli non si spense nella propria sede episcopale, ma nella sede del Ministero degli Interni, durante una cosiddetta inchiesta.

Come Vasile Aftenie, dimostrò la testimonianza cristiana, dimostrò ai suoi fedeli ed a coloro che sarebbero nati dopo di lui, come uno dei peccati più gravi sia quello di tradire la proprio coscienza, quel lume di verità che arde in noi e che nessun tiranno e senza Dio può toglierci.

L'opera del compianto professore Iacob Mârza è importante in quanto egli ha voluto presentare in un'unica opera, la vita e le opere del nobile sacerdote transilvano che era stato volutamente ignorato soprattutto prima del 1989, privando la storiografia romena di un apporto fondamentale.

Il compianto professor Iacob Mârza ha perciò fatto un'opera di ricostruzione preziosa cui hanno collaborato anche altri tra cui il figlio Radu e la figlia Andreea che hanno voluto offrire alla storiografia romena un'opera che sarà fondamentale e che chiarirà una volta per tutte l'importanza di questo sacerdote-scrittore, bibliotecario, che fu ricompensato dai comunisti per le sue attività con il carcere e le torture e poi con il tentativo di imporre il silenzio, al fine di indurci all'oblio.

Ma l'opera del professor Iacob Mârza è venuta per chiarire e per dimostrare la malvagità di quanti tradirono personaggi onesti e colti, cercando di imporre il silenzio e l'oblio.

Il volume si compone di cinque capitoli: *Restituiri Biografice* (Restituzioni biografiche), *Şantierale Istoricului* (I Cantieri dello storico), *Analiaza Istoriografica*.

Discurs istoric: (Analisi storiografica. Discorso storico), *Publicarea de texte ale lui Zenovie Pâclişanu* (Pubblicazione di testi di Zenovie Pâclişanu) e *Articole cu profil cultural* (Articoli dal profilo culturale); ogni capitolo contiene più sub capitoli e alla fine un *Indice analitico*.

Giuseppe MUNARINI

Ph.D. Researcher, "Nicolae Bocuşan" Institute of Ecclesiastical History at Babeş-Bolyai University Cluj-Napoca, Romania

Cosmin Popa, *Intelectualii lui Ceausescu si Academia de Stiinte Sociale si Politice (1970-1989) - Ceausescu's Intellectuals and the Academy of Social and Political Sciences (1970-1989)*, Editura Litera, Bucureşti, 2019, 352 p.

The volume "Ceausescu's Intellectuals and the Academy of Social and Political Sciences (1970-1989)" written by the researcher Cosmin Popa, edited by the Litera Publishing House in 2018, is a work that provides an overview of how the policies of the past have affected universities' life, respectively the elite of the time. What we can notice in the volume proposed for reviewing is the author's objective perspective on the motivation behind the creation of Nicolae Ceausescu's Academy of Social Sciences and Politics, a tool that would act in the interests of the communist system and propaganda.

The evolution of the sciences, but especially of the humanities in Romania, during the communist era was a period of stagnation that was due in the first stage to the promotion of *the ideal model of communist leader*, superior in all points of view but especially in comparison with the technocrats, fact which resulted in the first stage in minimizing the role of intelligentsia, which, as the author mentions, was meant to meet the needs of the people rather than the *bourgeoisie*. The controlled opening promoted by the party after 1965 obviously has an important impact on the research domain, making the international scientific presence of our elite a notable one - this period being characterized by an increase in the staff of the

research institutes. However, this period would come to an end shortly due to the system that had begun to suffer considerable financial losses in the 1970s and with the Communist leader eliminating spending in *areas he considered irrelevant*, one of which was research - budget cuts and reducing the number researchers and the number of institutes. What Cosmin Popa points out is how the regime, which, although already cut everything that it could in the field of research, is starting to effectively instrumentalize the technocrats. If we ask ourselves how Nicolae Ceausescu has succeeded to do this, Cosmin Popa gives us some objective answers: the researchers not only had to obey the absurd directives received from the *center* but were forced to motivate and sustain them; the institutes had to develop sociological analyzes to help the party reorganize communist propaganda; for those who collaborated and knew the apparatus of the party, it was easier to maintain or obtain higher positions, so more and more technocrats entered the party apparatus. Although the Academy of Social and Political Science was instrumental in promoting external propaganda, Cosmin Popa states that external propaganda is inconsistent in comparison with other communist states, offering the example of Hungary which was more efficient. This tells us that the Communist leader did not understand the true potential of research centers in the propagation of ideology externally.

Another aspect that the author brings to the attention of the readers in the work proposed for reviewing is how *history* was instrumentalized in different periods of communism, claiming that in the first phase national history had the role of *filling the ideological space vitiated by the a priori rejection of formulas elaborated in Moscow* - until 1968 history was used as an instrument of foreign policy propaganda, and for Ceausescu, history became an instrument of party propaganda, of nationalism that offered the regime a new justification. *The role of historians was taken by propagandists disguised as historians.*

Although there may be various negative reactions of intellectuals to Ceausescu's policies, the number of scholars obedient to the regime and propaganda made the voices of those who were opposed to the regime seldom heard, ignored or even eliminated under the careful attention of the Securitate.

We note the critical analysis of the researcher Cosmin Popa regarding Ceausescu's regime, which he divides into three distinct ideological main periods, from which he first characterized by *limited and conjunctural liberalization* (1965-1969) having the role of legitimizing Nicolae Ceausescu as the sole leader and modernizer of the country by opening up new channels of communication with the world that propagandistically represented a certain renunciation of socialist dogmatism. The second period, according to

the author, is between 1969 and 1974, a stage he calls the *transition*, the liberal elements present in the first stage are dissipating considerably, and the ideological center's intentions become more and more obvious, intermingling with the institutionalized by creating instruments such as the Academy of Social and Political Sciences, created *after the face and resemblance* of the Academy of Social Sciences of the USSR, with the obvious aim of undermining and minimizing the role of RSR Academy but especially of controlling through the politruks present in the new creation of Ceausescu. The third period of *Romanian neo-socialism*, in the opinion of researcher Cosmin Popa, began in 1974 and ended in the collapse of communism in Romania in 1989. This period was marked by the onset of personal dictatorship by which Nicolae Ceausescu held control over the entire apparatus of power.

Starting from the effort of the researcher Cosmin Popa, we can highlight some important aspects regarding the way in which the communist regime treated the research centers as instruments of promoting communist ideology but also to support the illusion of the superior *model bourgeoisie leader - intellectuals* because, as the author claims, Ceausescu had an inferiority complex in rapport with this *social class*. Apparently, *the symbiote between the party activist and the scientist had succeeded*.

Mădălina BRAEȘ

PhD Student, Faculty of History and Philosophy, Babeș-Bolyai University

Email: braes.madalina@gmail.com