

THE ODYSSEY OF A LOST AND FOUND ORATORIO

STELIAN IONAȘCU¹

SUMMARY. Following a tough dispute arisen between the composer Paul Constantinescu and the Byzantinist Pbr. I.D. Petrescu, long-time colleagues in the artistic field – a dispute intensively publicized in the musical milieu – the composer made a firm announcement according to which he had just destroyed an impressive score, *Passion and Resurrection (Byzantine Easter Oratorio)*, outgrowth of a collaboration between the two of them. Given the fact that this polemic was related to the authorship of the Oratorio, one can only imagine how deep must have been the tragedy born by Paul Constantinescu, so that he made the radical decision to ‘burn’ a work to which he had dedicated his vigour and artistical virtuosity for more than a decade! Paul Constantinescu rewrote the Oratorio, eliminating from the new version any contribution of Father Petrescu. Nevertheless, and despite the fact that all the influent niche media unanimously disseminated this piece of information and even the composer’s closest friends strongly confirmed the destruction of the first version of the oratorio, 70 years after the unfortunate conflict, the score was discovered safe and sound in the Library of UCMR (Union of the Composers and Musicologists in Romania²), proving to have miraculously survived, just like baby Moses in the basket, sent adrift in the bulrushes of the Nile. It is indeed the original, the one and only general score in the form of a manuscript, on which was based the concert held in 1946, with George Enescu and Constantin Silvestri as conductors. The following article retraces the itinerary of the score back from the moment of its disappearance, putting forward all the clues that lead to its rediscovery.

Keywords: oratorio, Byzantine monody, polemic, libretto, ecclesiastical music, melody.

Paul Constantinescu is the author of two oratorios, one dedicated to Easter and the other to Christmas. The *Byzantine Easter Oratorio (Passion and Resurrection)*, currently performed in all the concert seasons of both

¹ Pbr. Lect. Ph.D., Faculty of Orthodox Theology ‘Patriarch Justinian’, Bucharest.
E-mail: ionascust@yahoo.com

² UCMR is the professional organization of the musicians’ guild in Romania, founded in 1920.

Romanian and foreign major halls, is in fact the second version of the Oratorio. According to its author, he personally destroyed the first version as an outcome of a dispute that he had had with Pbr. I.D. Petrescu, a long-term collaborator of his who had purchased him the 13th century Byzantine monodies, translations and transcriptions of various manuscripts of the genre.

The first version of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio* had been staged on the 3rd of March 1946 at the Romanian Athenaeum in Bucharest, conducted by George Enescu and performed by the Philharmonic Orchestra, the 'Romania Choir' trained by Nicolae Lungu and the soloists: Nicolae Secăreanu, I. D. Petrescu, Nella Dimitriu, Mircea Buciu, Marieta Carțiș, Elisabeta Moldoveanu and Valentin Teodorian. Two other concerts were held the same year on the 17th of April and 27th of May respectively, with the same distribution, but with Constantin Silvestri as a conductor. Afterwards, silence descended. Music was silenced as rumours arose on the topic. An apparently insignificant error had slipped into the poster announcing the first night on the 3rd of March 1946, as Father I.D. Petrescu was mentioned only as a soloist, while he had expected to be acknowledged as a co-author of the work. The event gave birth to a severe dispute between Paul Constantinescu and the latter, each of the two involving his own partisans. Consequently, Paul Constantinescu decided to entirely discard this first version and to rewrite the Oratorio, with an additional fourth part entitled *The Resurrection*.

He completed this new version in 1948, accompanying the news with the official announcement that he had destroyed the first one. These tidings left the musical milieu in a state of shock, and a confusing mixture of regret, astonishment and disapproval resists up to our days in relation to the topic. As well as this, Paul Constantinescu's decision to rewrite the Oratorio followed a letter sent by Pbr. I.D. Petrescu to Emanoil Ciomac, back then the director of the Philharmonic Orchestra, in which he threatened to bring the case in front of the court if another performance of the Oratorio was to be held without him being informed and neglecting the error on the poster of the first night. Paul Constantinescu wrote an answer to this letter, stating that he was determined to put an end to this collaboration and that he was planning to write a new Oratorio, 'much better than the first one – I am convinced – thus his threats of going in front of the court are more than inapposite, even aimless'³. Ever since 1946, this Oratorio has never again been performed. Not even the second version, as soon after its rewriting in 1948, Communism was installed in Romania – a political regime hostile to the Church, implicitly to ecclesiastical music. Only

³ Stelian Ionașcu, *Paul Constantinescu și muzica psaltică românească* ['Paul Constantinescu and Romanian Psalm Music'], Editura Institutului Biblic, Bucharest, 2005, p. 381.

the *Byzantine Christmas Oratorio (The Nativity)* was much later programmed in the 'George Enescu' National Festival in 1967, cautiously disguised for the Communist Party leaders' eyes, namely without mentioning the work's title or author, specifying only the Philharmonic Orchestra, the conductor Mircea Basarab, the choir's conductor D.D. Botez and the soloists.

The first night of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio – Passion and Resurrection* was held in 1973, in Dresden (GDR), conducted by Martin Flämig and attended by the composer's wife. In Romania, this Oratorio was first performed much later, in 1990, under the baton of conductor Cristian Mandeal, as a tribute paid by the Romanian people to the heroes of the Revolution in 1989. Ever since, Paul Constantinescu's Oratorio is performed almost every year near Easter and various versions are recorded, which stands on every occasion as a truly exceptional gift for the public.

But there is still a question left without any proper answer: isn't there really any trace left of the first version of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio*? Paul Constantinescu stated firmly enough that he had 'burnt' the score, considering that the second version, which he completed on the 21st of June 1948, was the authentic and definitive one, suitable for production. Vasile Tomescu, the most conversant biographer of Paul Constantinescu's work, who had learnt many details from the composer himself, perpetuated with no trace of doubt this piece of information according to which the Oratorio had been destroyed⁴. In his memoirs, Ion Dumitrescu, a close friend of the composer, also gives a firm testimony that the first version of the score was burnt⁵. On the other hand, Titus Moisescu, and apprentice of Pbr. I.D. Petrescu, states that Father Petrescu himself was surprised by Paul Constantinescu's radical act of destroying the score, leaving not even a trace of the work's parts⁶. I chose to entitle this article 'The Odyssey of a Lost and Found Oratorio' because despite all evidence, several clues progressively lead me to the (re)discovery of the general score of the mysterious first version of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio* written by Paul Constantinescu.

The earliest decryption of the first version of the Oratorio was possible due to Father I.D. Petrescu, who was as inspired as to edit a brochure entitled *Patimile Domnului – Oratoriu de Paul Constantinescu și Părintele I. D. Petrescu. Explicațiuni și textul cântat*⁷, though lacking the

⁴ Vasile Tomescu, *Paul Constantinescu*, Editura Muzicală, Bucharest, 1967, p. 262.

⁵ Ion Dumitrescu, 'Filele mele de calendar' ['My Calendar Sheets'], *Muzica*, No. 3/1996, pp. 107-112.

⁶ Titus Moisescu, *Monodia bizantină în gândirea unor muzicieni români* ['The Byzantine Monody in the Conception of Several Romanian Musicians'], Editura Muzicală, Bucharest, 1999, p. 58.

⁷ *The Passion of Our Lord – Oratorio by Paul Constantinescu and Father I.D. Petrescu. Scores and explanations.*

composer's consent. The brochure was edited in 1946 by Tipografia Cărților Bisericești⁸ in Bucharest. I consider it 'inspired' because it outlines a first path leading to the libretto of the Oratorio, though not in accordance with Paul Constantinescu's vision, as the title of the brochure states Father I.D. Petrescu as co-author, while the original title of the Oratorio, given by Paul Constantinescu himself, offers a more nuanced account of the contribution each of the two had, with reference to the copyright: *Patimile Domnului – oratoriu de Paști pe texte bisericești bizantine din secolul al XIII-lea reconstituite și traduse de părintele I.D. Petrescu, autor Paul Constantinescu*⁹. The brochure has 42 pages and it comprises: a *preface* signed by I.D. Ștefănescu, several explanations written by Pbr. I.D. Petrescu, *the text of the Oratorio* (pages 14-36), a list of the members of the Philharmonic Orchestra, a list of the members of the 'Romania Choir', and on the last page, a list of the soloists' names and of the three performances held in 1946. This is a first draft that one can outline in relation to the content of the Oratorio – not to the music itself, but rather to its organisation: for instance, the choirs are different from the second version, but there are also several common elements, such as the Evangelist's recitative or the four choirs arranged exclusively by Paul Constantinescu. In my Ph.D. thesis¹⁰, published in 2005, I made a first simultaneous presentation of the two librettos (pages 201-224). The named thesis comprises another uncommon element: the musical arrangements for the five choirs in the lost version of the Oratorio. This is a first account of the early music transcribed by Pbr. I.D. Petrescu and perfectly elaborated by Paul Constantinescu. Even though it lacks the entire orchestral apparatus, as the score parts are only for the choir, it still remains a first attempt to confront the prior obscurity on the topic. Starting with the years 1933-1934, 'auditions' were held at the Church of Saint Vissarion in Bucharest (13 auditions according to my sources), parish lead by Pbr. I.D. Petrescu. During these auditions, the choir of the church, lead by Paul Constantinescu, used to perform: Byzantine chants reconstituted by Father I.D. Petrescu from Greek manuscripts (many of whose texts and melodic patterns were to be found later on in the Oratorio itself), Gregorian chants, motets and excerpts from Paul Constantinescu's *Divine Liturgy*, a work completed on the 3rd of February 1936. Given the fact that it lacked the general score, the first version of the Oratorio could not have been integrally reconstituted, but still,

⁸ Ecclesiastical Books' Printing House.

⁹ *The Passion of Our Lord – an Easter Oratorio Based on Ecclesiastical Byzantine Texts from the 13th Century, Recomposed and Translated by Father I.D. Petrescu, author Paul Constantinescu.*

¹⁰ Stelian Ionașcu, *op. cit.*, pp. 201-224.

one can get a general idea based on the libretto and on the analysis of the five choirs, as they were performed under the batons of George Enescu and Constantin Silvestri in 1946. The parts written by Paul Constantinescu were entrusted to the Choral Society 'Carmen', led by I. D. Chirescu. From certain reasons, the vocal part of the Oratorio was entrusted to 'Romania Choir', led by Nicolae Lungu¹¹. These parts were strayed in the Library of Choral Society 'Carmen', a rather inaccessible division in the custody of the University of Music in Bucharest and I must confess that I came across them mostly by chance. The following list comprises the parts for the five mention choirs, never publicized before the above-mentioned date:

1. *Se adună acum soborul Iudeilor*¹² (choir No. 1 of Part I of the Oratorio; the first strophe of 'La laude'¹³ on the Great and Holy Thursday);
2. *Iuda, cel fără de lege, Doamne*¹⁴ (choir No. 6 of Part I; the second strophe of the Vespers on the Great and Holy Thursday);
3. *Iuda, vânzătorul, viclean fiind*¹⁵ (choir No. 10 of Part I; the third strophe of the Vespers on the Great and Holy Thursday);
4. *Cu adevărat, Iuda*¹⁶ (choir No. 12 of Part I; an excerpt from 'Slavă... Și acum...'¹⁷ of the Vespers);
5. *Nimeni, o, credincioșilor*¹⁸ (choir No. 14 of Part I; the fourth part of the Aposticha).

The first page of the score parts (SATB) comprises the title: *The Passion of Our Lord – an Easter Oratorio Based on Ecclesiastical Byzantine Texts from the 13th Century, Recomposed and Translated by Father I.D. Petrescu*, after which Paul Constantinescu's name stands as the composer of the work. The five choirs from the first part of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio* offer a complete account of the 'sound' of the Oratorio. First of all, each and every choral part is based on monodies extracted from the 2nd

¹¹ Valentin Teodorian stresses that Nicolae Lungu received the score parts from Paul Constantinescu, 'after another choir of those times' [the 'Carmen' choir] had abandoned any approach to it, 'as the conductors had stated that this musical masterpiece comprises insurmountable difficulties for any group of the genre at that time.' Valentin Teodorian, *Pagini din viața muzicianului Nicolae Lungu. Scurtă monografie* ['Pages from the Life of Musician Nicolae Lungu. A Short Monography'], Holy-Prest, Bucharest, 1993, p. 38.

¹² 'The Judaeans' Synod Is Gathering Now'.

¹³ 'Praise' – a part of the Orthodox religious service on the Great and Holy Thursday.

¹⁴ 'Judas, the Outlaw, Oh, My Lord'.

¹⁵ 'Judas, the Traitor, Sly as He Was'.

¹⁶ 'Truly, Judas'.

¹⁷ The trinitarian formula phrase.

¹⁸ 'Nobody, Oh, Believers'.

volume of the work *Studii de paleografie muzicală*¹⁹, transcribed and arranged by Pbr. I.D. Petrescu. In my Ph.D. thesis, I also presented a short analysis of these scores²⁰. Apart from these five choir parts, which the composer adapted for the exigencies of an orchestra, in the Library of the Parish of Saint Vissarion in Bucharest there were also left several choir parts bearing the trace of Father I.D. Petrescu's processing: *Privegehați și vă rugați*²¹ (in Paul Constantinescu's second version it can be identified as No. 21 of Part II, third antiphon after The Gospel According to John – XIV 12, 13), *De trei ori tăgăduindu-te Petru*²² (No. 29 of Part II, as the seventh antiphon) and *La cina Ta, Hristoase*²³ (No. 21 of Part II, as the third antiphon on the Great and Holy Thursday).

But, happily and mysteriously, the first version of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio (The Passion of Our Lord)*, fruit of the collaboration between Paul Constantinescu and Pbr. I.D. Petrescu, 'arose' 'by chance' in the Library of UCMR in 2010. Such an unexpected emergence of the score can be considered indeed miraculous, as Paul Constantinescu had apparently left it untouched, then somebody kept it hidden until that moment. Thus, the hypothesis of its destruction was declared invalid. Let us not forget, though, that in 2004, the 'reappearance' of this Oratorio was notified by Lect. Sanda Hîrlav-Maistorovici in a cultural periodical called 'Axioma'²⁴. Nevertheless, her article stirred no notable echo in the musical milieu, despite the fact that the score has been exhibited at the Museum 'George Enescu' for several days. Therefore, I must confess that the excitement I felt when I first opened and went through this score, page by page, stirred some very subjective feelings which I find difficult to express²⁵. After the special archive 'Paul

¹⁹ 'Studies of Musical Paleography'.

²⁰ Stelian Ionașcu, *op. cit.*, pp. 59-166.

²¹ 'Stay Awake and Pray'.

²² 'Three Times Peter Denying You'.

²³ 'Sitting at Your Holy Supper, Christ'.

²⁴ Sanda Hîrlav-Maistorovici, 'Despre un manuscris «pierdut»... și regăsit: *Oratoriul de Paști* de Paul Constantinescu (I)' ['On a «Lost»... and Found Manuscript: the *Easter Oratorio* by Paul Constantinescu (I)'], in *Axioma*, No. 7 (52), July 2004 and 'Despre... (II)', in: *Axioma*, No. 8 (53), August 2004.

²⁵ Such feelings are similar to those confessed by Arh. Sebastian Barbu Bucur in an interview taken by Elena Chircev: 'The Mother of Our Lord – the Lady of Mount Athos – who had helped me to reach Athos, also helped me discover, in the library of the Great Lavra, the original version of Mihalache Moldovlahul's «Anastasimatar», written in 1767, which I had considered lost for a long time.' (*Manuscriste muzicale românești în bibliotecile athonite* ['Romanian Musical Manuscripts in Athonian Libraries'], an interview by Elena Chircev with Arhid. Prof. Ph.D. Sebastian Barbu-Bucur, in *Tabora*, No. 4, year II, July 2008 ['Mount Athos'], approximate translation in English.) Several other lost scores are notable in the history of music. There is information about a certain original mass by J.S. Bach, namely *Markus-*

Constantinescu' from UCMR was inventorized, this score became indeed a 'treasure' previously buried and then brought to light as a true masterpiece, revitalized as a Phoenix, to be relaunched in the circulation of Romanian and universal music. In 2010, Mr. Octavian Lazăr Cosma – president of UCMR – entrusted me the score as a premiere and advised me to elaborate a short comparative analysis of the two versions of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio*. Which I did in a study published in *Muzica* journal²⁶.

The general score of the first version of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio* is a manuscript kept in the Library of UCMR, in a particular section, inventorized with the number 540. The actual cover of the manuscript comprises the following title: 'The Passion of Our Lord' (underlined), and beneath, 'an Easter Oratorio Based on Ecclesiastical Byzantine Texts, recomposed and translated by Father I. D. Petrescu'. Downwards, the signature: 'P. Constantinescu' and the years '1941-1943'. This cover is coated in a white sheet of paper (with a coloured verso), on which it is written, on the top, 'The Passion of Our Lord' (underlined), and on the bottom-right it is signed 'P. Constantinescu, 1943'. An additional false cover veils the score – a white sheet left unwritten; as far as I am concerned, this might have been the minimal 'concealment' used by the composer when he decided to 'bury' the manuscript, announcing in the musical milieu that he had burnt it. On the first page the title is repeated, with an additional note written in pencil by the composer himself: '... based on ecclesiastical themes [from the 13th century]', and the signature 'P. Constantinescu, 1941-1943'. On the bottom-left of the same page there is another text, obliquely written in blue: '**This score can be performed no more. Its copying, even fragmentary, is strictly forbidden**'; signed: '**P. Constantinescu**' and dated: '„20.VI.'948"²⁷. I remarked that in the author's handwriting, the line of

Passion (BWV 247), lost nowadays. Its existence is confirmed by current musicology (the libretto survived), but the score still remains untraceable. It is not impossible that this score, or at least its individual parts, should be rediscovered one day. There are two famous precedents in this respect: *Cello Concerto No. 1 in C Major* by Joseph Haydn, written in 1761, lost afterwards, was retrieved 200 years later in the archives of the National Museum in Prague and *Funeral Song*, by Igor Stravinski, written in 1908 in the memory of his mentor Nikolai Rimski-Korsakov, which had been played only once before it became untraceable and was found in 2015 in an uninventorized section of the Library of Sankt Petersburg State Conservatory, during some restoration works.

²⁶ Stelian Ionașcu, *Mărgăritarul ascuns în țarină... sau Pasărea Phoenix* ['The Buried Treasure... or The Phoenix'], in *Muzica*, No. 1, 2010, pp. 39-50.

²⁷ One can assume that between 1946-1948 the conflict between Paul Constantinescu and Father I.D. Petrescu 'rose as dough'; on the 22nd of June 1948, the composer was completing the score of the second version of the Oratorio and, two days earlier, on the 20th of June 1948, he was writing the 'sentence' by which he discarded the first version; nevertheless, he could not endure the destruction of the score.

the 't' from 'Constantinescu' and the underlining of the date are stressed, which outlines his firm determination and somehow the passion he experienced at that moment. This 'sentence' can disarm anyone who might dare to turn the page and to go through the manuscript. Of course, one cannot avoid wondering: To what point the composer's decision must be respected? What does 'copying' actually mean? Can this refer also to reproducing certain musical examples in a study or to extracting several choral pieces for partial performing? Might the infringement of the composer's wish arise moral or canonical issues more than half a century after his conflict with Pbr. I.D. Petrescu?

From the perspective of ecclesiastical canons, the ecclesiastical jurisdiction is prescribed if it failed to be exercised for a period of 30 years²⁸. One can assume that the term of the prescription being 30 years, the conflict between the two has come to an end²⁹. Moreover, given the fact that the two prominent figures of the Romanian musical environment have both died, the **reappearance** and the **reevaluation** of this work, fruit of their collaboration, becomes an opportunity for symbolically coming to peace. I consider that the composer's statement is not irrevocable, nor does it constitute a damnation. By announcing that he had burnt the score and its parts, Paul Constantinescu **aimed to end the conflict with Father I.D. Petrescu, but, by still keeping the score, the composer left an open door so that the future generations could analyze, maybe even interpret it**. Eventually, the score remains the fruit of his work, which he had to deny formally, constrained by infelicitous circumstances.

The two versions of the score do not resemble, but they are not entirely different either; given the fact that they are both the creation of the same composer, the two scores of the *Byzantine Easter Oratorio* share common elements, such as: the structure of the Gospels³⁰, the choir parts

²⁸ 'Canonul 17 de la Sinodul IV Ecumenic' ['The 17th Canon of the 4th Ecumenical Council'] and 'Canonul 25 de la Sinodul Trulan' ['The 25th Canon of the Council in Trullo'], in Arhid. Prof. Ph.D. Ioan N. Floca, *Canoanele Bisericii Ortodoxe. Note și comentarii* ['The Canons of the Orthodox Church. Notes and Commentaries'], Sibiu, 2005.

²⁹ Article 27 – (1) The duration of copyright for works elaborated in co-authorship is 70 years since the death of the last co-author. (Law No. 8 / 14th of March 1996 regarding copyright and related rights [Romanian Law]).

³⁰ The proportion of the Evangelist's recitative is quite significant, as this is the constant element of the Oratorio, which Paul Constantinescu extracted entirely from the first version, particularly as its completion was extremely quick... (according to Ion Dumitrescu, *art. cit.*, p. 111, Paul Constantinescu 'burnt the score' most probably in October 1947, after Ion Dumitrescu's wedding; the second version of the Oratorio was completed in brief for the soloists, choir and piano on the 24th of April 1948, and the completion of the general score followed on the 22nd of June the same year). Such an extensive work – 221 pages of orchestra score – could never have been completed in only half a year without keeping the

based on texts of the Bible, freely composed by the author³¹, constructions with identical forms for different chants (to be compared: *Aliluia* and *Prohodul*³² from each version), but also distinct elements issued from the difference between the chants and from the additional fourth part in the second version, *The Resurrection*.

To begin with, I am indicating the essential differences between the two versions. The similarities are to be identified in the table comprising the presentation of the two scores in parallel:



- the two versions have different titles: 1. *The Passion of Our Lord – an Easter Oratorio Based on Ecclesiastical Byzantine Texts...* and 2. *Easter Byzantine Oratorio – Passion and Resurrection*;
- the composer eliminates from the second version 30 chants recomposed and translated by Pbr. I. D. Petrescu³³ and replaces them with other ecclesiastical chants driven from the current practice of the Church;
- the second version does not end with the Funerals of Our Lord, but continues with the Resurrection, triumphantly ending with the hymn ‘Christ is Risen’;
- if, in both versions, Parts I and III can be considered ‘mirrored’, sharing the same structure, Part II is more developed in the first version, as the composer eliminated several excerpts from the Gospel without always replacing them with alternative chants, similar to those translated by Father Petrescu.

composer’s original contribution from the first version. (Stelian Ionașcu, *Paul Constantinescu...*, *op. cit.*, p. 171).

³¹ *Nu cumva sunt eu?* [‘Couldn’t That One Be Me?’], *Bucură-te, Împărate al iudeilor* [‘Rejoice, Emperor of the Judaeans’], *Să se răstignească* [‘Crucify Him’], *Pe Varava* [‘Exempt Barabas’] (approximate translations).

³² ‘The Requiem of Our Lord’.

³³ For reasons of space, I am enumerating here the titles of the chants only in approximate English translation. To confront them with the original Romanian titles, please see the comparative table of the two versions of the Oratorio in this study. The chants are entitled as follows: ‘The Judaeans’ Synod Is Gathering Now’ (choir), ‘Today, Judas’ (baritone solo air), ‘Judas, the Outlaw, Oh, My Lord’ (choir), ‘Judas, the Treacherous Servant’ (alto solo air), ‘Truly, Judas’ (choir), ‘Nobody, Oh, Believers’ (choir), ‘Aliluia’ (choir), ‘The Peoples’ Noblemen’ (bass solo), ‘Judas Came Running and Said...’ (choir), ‘Sitting at Your Holy Supper, Christ’ (choir), ‘Today, Judas Leaves the Master’ (choir), ‘Let Us Love Our Brothers’ (choir), ‘Today, Judas Stays Awake’ (alto and bass duet), ‘Three Times Peter Denying You’ (choir), ‘Confess, You, Outlaws’ (choir), ‘They Paid for Him Thirty Pieces of Silver’ (choir), ‘The One Who Enclothes in Light...’ (choir), ‘For the Good You Did’ (monody accompanied by choir and orchestra), ‘These Are the Words of God’ (choir), ‘They Undressed Him’ (choir), ‘Lord, You, Who Took Upon You...’ (baritone solo air), ‘The Thief...’ (choir), ‘When Seeing You Crucified’ (choir and alto solo), ‘Two Wrongs...’ (choir and bass solo), ‘When Seeing You Crucified On Wood’ (choir), ‘My Son’ (alto solo), ‘In the Grave, You, Life’ (choir).

First version of the <i>Easter Oratorio</i>	Second version of the <i>Easter Oratorio</i>
<p><u><i>The Passion of Our Lord</i></u> <u><i>An Easter Oratorio</i></u> <i>Based on Ecclesiastical Byzantine Texts [from the 13th Century], Recomposed and Translated by <u>Father I.D. Petrescu</u></i></p>	<p><u><i>Passion and Resurrection</i></u> <u><i>Byzantine Easter Oratorio</i></u></p>
<p>Signature: P. Constantinescu 1941-1943</p>	<p>Signature: P. Constantinescu 1948</p>
Part I	
<p>Page 1: Orchestral debut</p>	<p>Page 1: Orchestral debut</p> <p style="text-align: center;">IDENTICAL</p> <p>Differences between measures 8-10; also between measures 13-17 there is a theme in version I which is not to be found in version II.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Andante (♩=60) Var.1 reper 1</p>  <p>Ob. </p>
<p>Page 12: Choir: Se adună acum...³⁴, [monody from the 13th century, Echos 2]</p>	<p>Page 9: Choir: Aliluia, Echos 8. [at the beginning of Monday Mattins]</p> <p style="text-align: center;">DIFFERENT</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Identical orchestral structure, four measures</p>
<p>Page 17: The Gospel According to Luke XXII, 1-6</p>	<p>Page 24: The Gospel According to Luke XXII, 1-6 [at Thursday Mattins]</p> <p style="text-align: center;">IDENTICAL</p>
<p>Page 20: Air. Baritone: Astăzi Iuda...³⁵ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 8]</p>	<p>Page 27: Baritone solo: Cămara Ta, Mântuitorul meu³⁶ [Exapostilaria, Echos 8, at Monday Mattins]</p>

³⁴ 'The Judaeans' Synod Is Gathering Now'.

³⁵ 'Today, Judas'.

³⁶ 'Your Chamber, Oh, My Lord and Saviour'.

DIFFERENT

Identical beginning of the orchestral theme

Page 33: The Gospel
According to Luke XXII, 7, 8,
13-21

Page 31: The Gospel According to Luke XXII, 7, 8,
13-21

IDENTICAL

Differences:

- the distribution of text on the same musical pattern:

Var. 1 (p.35)

Iisus

nu voi mai mân - ca_ din - tru a - ces-tea, pâ - nă

Var. 2 (p.33)

Iisus

nu voi mai mân - ca_ din - tru a - ces-tea, pâ - nă

- melodic changes³⁷:

Var.1 (p.36) *cresc.*

Iisus

pâ - nă când va ve - ni îm - pă - ră - ți - a lui Dum - ne - zeu

Var. 2 (p.34) *cresc.*

Iisus

pâ - nă când va ve - ni îm - pă - ră - ți - a lui Dum - ne - zeu

Var. 1 (p.37)

Iisus

în - tru po - me - ni - - - rea mea.

Var.2 (p.36)

Iisus

în - tru po - me - ni - - - rea mea.

³⁷ The melodic changes in the liturgical recitative can be explained by Father Petrescu's accusation according to which Paul Constantinescu 'used the cadencies in the liturgical recitative similarly to the way I sing them in the Church of Saint Vissarion...' (approximate translation of the quotation; see 'Scrisorile' ['The Letters'], in Stelian Ionașcu, *Paul Constantinescu..., op. cit.*, pp. 374-381).

Var. 1 (p.38)

Iisus
pen - tru voi se var - - - să

Var. 2 (p.36)

Iisus
pen - tru voi se var - - - să

Page 40: Choir: ***Nu cumva sunt eu?***³⁸

Page 37: Choir: ***Nu cumva sunt eu?***

IDENTICAL

In the second version, the composer makes a note on the bottom of the page, explaining the way in which the choir should interpret the piece.

Page 43: Choir: ***Iuda cel fără de lege***³⁹ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 2]

Page 40: Choir: ***Ospătând la cină***⁴⁰ [Sedelna Echos 7, the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord]

DIFFERENT

Page 48: Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 36-39

Page 48: Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 36-39

IDENTICAL

Page 52: Air. Alto: ***Iuda, sluga și vicleanul***⁴¹ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 2]

Page 46: Alto solo: ***Temându-ne, fraților***⁴² [on Monday evening – at the 'Aposticha', Echos 8, stichos. 1]

DIFFERENT

Page 61: The Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 40-42

Page 49: The Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 40-42

IDENTICAL

- melodic differences:

³⁸ 'Couldn't That One Be Me?'

³⁹ 'Judas, the Outlaw, Oh, My Lord'.

⁴⁰ 'Feasting at Supper'.

⁴¹ 'Judas, the Treacherous Servant'.

⁴² 'Let Us Have Fear, Brothers'.

THE ODYSSEY OF A LOST AND FOUND ORATORIO

Var. 1 (p. 62)

Var. 2 (p.50)

Page 64: Choir: **Iuda vânzătorul**⁴³ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 2]

Page 52: Choir: **Iată Mirele**⁴⁴ [the hymn, Echos 8 – on Monday Mattins]

DIFFERENT

Page 67: The Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 43-46
+ Cor: **Cu adevărat**⁴⁵
[melodie din sec. XIII, mod 6]
p.77 Evanghelia Matei XXVI, 47-49

Page 54: The Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 43-49

**The Evangelist's recitative is identical
The choir is missing!**

Page 80: Choir: **Nimeni, o, credincioșilor**⁴⁶ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 8]

Page 61: Choir: **Nimenea să nu fie neîmpărtășit**⁴⁷
[at the 'Aposticha', verses Echos 8, stichos 4 – at Thursday Mattins]

DIFFERENT

Part II

Page 89: Choir: **Aliluia**
[monody from the 17th century, Echos 8]
Construction similar to *Aliluia* from Part I, second version

Page 74: Orchestra

DIFFERENT

Page 105: Gospel According to John XIII, 31, 32, 34-35

Page 75: Gospel According to John XIII, 31, 32, 34-35

IDENTICAL

Small textual differences: 's-a slăvit' (version 1), 's-a proslăvit' (version 2)

⁴³ 'Judas, the Treacherous'.

⁴⁴ 'Look, The Groom is Coming'.

⁴⁵ 'Truly, Judas'.

⁴⁶ 'Nobody, Oh, Believers'.

⁴⁷ 'Let No One Remain Outwards the Eucharist'.

Page 107: Choir: Antiphon I – Boierii popoarelor ⁴⁸ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 8]	Page 77: Choir and bass solo: Boierii popoarelor [the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord – Antiphon I, stichos 1, 2, Echos 8]
DIFFERENT The same chant, different melodic patterns.	
Page 108: Gospel According to John XIV, 1, 6 Choir: Antiphon II: Alergat-a grăind, luda ⁴⁹ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 6] Page 113: Gospel According to John XIV, 12, 13 Choir: Antiphon III: La cina Ta, Hristoase ⁵⁰ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 2]	Absence
DIFFERENT	
Page 122: Gospel According to John XVIII, 12-14	Page 80: Gospel According to John XVIII, 12-14
IDENTICAL	
Page 123: Choir: Antiphon IV: Astăzi luda lasă pre dascălu ⁵¹ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 5] Construction similar to Astăzi S-a spânzurat pe lemn ⁵² , choir from Part III of the second version (page 134).	Page 81: Choir: Adună-se acum soboru ⁵³ [‘Lauds’, stichos 1, Echos 2, on Thursday morning]
DIFFERENT	
Page 128: Gospel According to John XIV, 15, 21 Choir: Antiphon V – lubire de frați să avem ⁵⁴ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 1] Page 132: Gospel According	Absence

⁴⁸ ‘The Peoples’ Noblemen’.

⁴⁹ ‘Judas Came Running and Said...’

⁵⁰ ‘Sitting at Your Holy Supper, Christ’.

⁵¹ ‘Today, Judas Leaves the Master’.

⁵² ‘Today, Christ Was Crucified on Wood’.

⁵³ ‘The Synod Is Gathering Now’.

⁵⁴ ‘Let Us Love Our Brothers’.

<p>to John XIV, 27 Choir: Antiphon VI: Astăzi priveghează Iuda⁵⁵ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 7, varis]</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">DIFFERENT</p>
<p>Page 135: Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 57-58; 69-75</p>	<p>Page 89: Gospel According to Matthew XXVI, 57-58; 69-75</p> <p style="text-align: center;">IDENTICAL</p>
<p>Page 142: Choir: Antiphon VII: De trei ori tăgăduindu-te Petru⁵⁶ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 8]</p>	<p>Page 97: Choir: De trei ori tăgăduindu-te Petru [the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord – Antiphon VII, stichos. 2, Echos 8]</p> <p style="text-align: center;">DIFFERENT</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The same chant, different melodic patterns.</p>
<p>Page 143: Gospel According to John XV, 5 Choir: Antiphon VIII: Spuneți călcătorilor de lege⁵⁷ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 6] Page 148: Gospel According to John XV, 10 Choir: Antiphon IX: Pus-au treizeci de arginți⁵⁸ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 3]</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Absence</p> <p style="text-align: center;">DIFFERENT</p>
<p>Page 151: Gospel According to John XVIII, 28-36</p>	<p>Page 99: Gospel According to John XVIII, 28-36</p> <p style="text-align: center;">IDENTICAL</p> <p>Small textual differences: 'făcător de rău' (version 1), 'făcător de rele'⁵⁹ (version 2)</p>
<p>Page 160: Choir: Antiphon X: Cel ce se îmbracă cu lumina⁶⁰ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 6]</p>	<p>Page 108: Choir: O, dumnezeiescu!⁶¹ [Kontakion Echos 4 – from the Resurrection religious service – chant No. 9, stichos 2]</p>

⁵⁵ 'Today, Judas Stays Awake'.

⁵⁶ 'Three Times Peter Denying You'.

⁵⁷ 'Confess, You, Outlaws'.

⁵⁸ 'They Paid for Him Thirty Pieces of Silver'.

⁵⁹ Both phrases have the meaning of 'malefactor' or 'wrongdoer'.

⁶⁰ 'The One Who Enclothes in Light...'

⁶¹ 'Oh, The Divine...'

DIFFERENT

Page 164: Gospel According to John XV, 17-18
Choir: Antiphon XI: **Pentru binele care ai făcut**⁶²
[monody from the 13th century, Echos 6]
Page 169: Gospel According to John XVII, 1, 4, 5
Choir: Antiphon XII – **Acestea zice Domnul**⁶³
[monody from the 13th century, Echos 8]

Absence

Page 174: Gospel According to Matthew XXVII, 15-17; 21, 22

Page 111: Gospel According to Matthew XXVII, 15-17; 21, 22

IDENTICAL

Part III

Page 185: Gospel According to Mark XV, 16-19

Page 122: Gospel According to Mark XV, 16-19

IDENTICAL

Pesante **TEMA DESTINULUI**

Trb.

Tuba

Page 190: Choir: **Dezbrăcatu-L-au de haina Sa**⁶⁴ [monody from the 13th century, Echos 6]

Page 127: Choir: **Dezbrăcatu-M-au pe Mine**⁶⁵ [the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord, 'Stichera' Echos 6 ('Sinaxar')]

DIFFERENT

The same chant, different melodic patterns.

⁶² 'For the Good You Did'.

⁶³ 'These Are the Words of God'.

⁶⁴ 'They Undressed Him...'

⁶⁵ 'They Undressed Me'.

Page 192: Gospel According to Mark XV, 20, 27	Page 132: Gospel According to Mark XV, 20, 27	IDENTICAL
Page 193: Choir: Air. Baritone solo: Doamne, care ai primit ⁶⁶ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 8]	Page 134: Choir: Astăzi s-a spânzurat pre lemn ⁶⁷ [the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord – Antiphon XV, Stichos 1, Echos 6]	DIFFERENT
Page 194: Gospel According to Luke XXIII, 39-43	Page 143: Gospel According to Luke XXIII, 39-43	IDENTICAL
Page 197: Choir: Pre tâlharu ⁶⁸ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 3]	Page 146: Choir: Întru o zi ⁶⁹ [‘Exapostilaria’ – the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord (the ‘Sinaxar’), Echos 3]	DIFFERENT The same chant, different melodic patterns, the topic of the text inverted.
Page 198: Gospel According to John XIX, 25, 26	Page 146: Gospel According to John XIX, 25, 26	IDENTICAL
Page 199: Choir and Alto solo: Văzându-te răstignit, Hristoase ⁷⁰ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 6]	Page 148: Choir and Alto solo: Pre lemn răstignit văzându-te ⁷¹ [the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord, fifth ‘Stichera’ Echos 2 (the ‘Sinaxar’)]	DIFFERENT
Page 200: Gospel According to Matthew XXVII, 45-48	Page 152: Gospel According to Matthew XXVII, 45-48	IDENTICAL
Page 205: Orchestral interlude Gospel According to Luke XXIII, 45, 46	Page 153: Orchestral interlude Gospel According to Luke XXIII, 45, 46	

⁶⁶ ‘Lord, You, Who Took Upon You...’

⁶⁷ ‘Today Christ Has Been Crucified On Wood’.

⁶⁸ ‘The Thief’.

⁶⁹ ‘In One Day’.

⁷⁰ ‘When Seeing You Crucified’.

⁷¹ ‘When Seeing You Crucified On Wood’.

IDENTICAL	
Page 210: Bass solo and choir: <i>Două și rele a făcut</i> ⁷² [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 3]	Page 161: Choir: <i>Răscumpăra-tu-ne-ai pre noi</i> ⁷³ [the 'Sedelna-Prosomion' – the religious service of the Passion of Our Lord, Echos 4 (chromatic)]
DIFFERENT	
Page 213: Gospel According to Mark XV, 43, 45	Page 163: Gospel According to Mark XV, 43, 45
IDENTICAL	
Page 215: Choir and Alto solo: <i>Pre lemn văzându-te răstignit</i> ⁷⁴ [monody from the 13 th century, Echos 2]	Absence
DIFFERENT	
Page 218: Gospel According to John XIX, 39-42	Page 164: Gospel According to John XIX, 39-42
IDENTICAL	
Page 224: Choir: <i>The Requiem: În mormânt, Viață</i> ⁷⁵ [monody from the 17 th century, Echos 5 – a manuscript dating from the times of Constantin Brâncoveanu]	Page 170: Choir: <i>The Requiem: În mormânt, Viață</i> [a compiled melodic pattern based on Musicescu, Filotei, Nifon Ploieșteanul and Macarie]
DIFFERENT	
The same chant and formal structure, similar orchestral structures, different melodic patterns.	
Page 235: The end and blessed be the Lord! Bucharest, the 6 th of October 1943 Signature: P. Constantinescu	↓
Part IV	
Absence	Page 185: Orchestra

⁷² 'Two Wrongs'.

⁷³ 'You Redeemed Us'.

⁷⁴ 'When Seeing You Crucified On Wood'.

⁷⁵ 'In the Grave, You, Life'.

	<p>Gospel According to Mark XVI, 1-4 Page 188: Choir: Plângerea mironosițelor⁷⁶ [As it is used to be sung in Jerusalem on the Great and Holy Friday after the Vespers – Echos 8] Page 196: Gospel according to Mark XVI, 5-7 [at Sunday Mattins] Page 199: Choir: Hristos a înviat!⁷⁷, Echos 2</p>
	<p>Page 220: Signature: P. Constantinescu Bucharest, the 22nd of May 1948</p>

It is rather difficult to predict the events entailed by the rediscovery of this score. Paul Constantinescu's religious creation has become a true fountain for research, both in laic and in ecclesiastical musical environments. This new discovery is prone to draw the musicians' attention, who will value or – on the contrary – will criticize it. What is sure is that the score will truly be rebrought to life only when it is performed. If this first version of the *Easter Oratorio* is to be performed again, the concert should be a true feast, a celebration of ecclesiastical music and not an apple of discord that would stir partisans and belligerent sides to develop perpetual discussions on the 'paternity' or the superiority of one of the versions, or other sterile polemics as such. What I can actually predict is a certain confusion of the audience, faithful to the already known version, for whom the choir parts comprised in the patrimony of Orthodox chants are quite familiar, unlike the Byzantine monodies from the 13th century on which is based the first version of the Easter Oratorio.

REFERENCES

Score:

- Constantinescu, Paul, *Patimile Domnului - oratoriu de Paști pe texte bisericești bizantine din secolul al XIII-lea reconstituite și traduse de părintele I.D. Petrescu* 1943, [The Passion of Our Lord – an Easter Oratorio Based on Ecclesiastical Byzantine Texts from the 13th Century, Recomposed and Translated by Father I.D. Petrescu], Biblioteca Uniunii Compozitorilor, nr. inventar 540.
- Paul Constantinescu, *Patimile și Învierea Domnului – Oratoriu bizantin de Paști* [The Byzantine Easter Oratorio, Passion and Resurrection] 1948, Biblioteca Uniunii Compozitorilor, nr. inventar 498.

⁷⁶ 'Women's of the Passion Lament'.

⁷⁷ 'Christ Is Risen!'

Books and studies:

- ***, *Manuscrise muzicale românești în bibliotecile athonite* ['Romanian Musical Manuscripts in Athonian Libraries'], an interview by Elena Chircev with Arhid. Prof. Ph.D. Sebastian Barbu-Bucur, in *Tabor*, No. 4, year II, July 2008 ['Mount Athos'], approximate translation in English.
- Coroiu, Petruța-Maria –Belibou, Alexandra, Originality of Approach to the Psalmic Melody in *Liturgy in the Psalmic Style* by Paul Constantinescu, in *Studia UBB Musica*, LXII, 2, 2017 (p. 87 – 94)
<http://www.studia.ubbcluj.ro/download/pdf/1129.pdf>
- Dumitrescu, Ion, 'Filele mele de calendar' ['My Calendar Sheets'], *Muzica*, No. 3/1996, pp. 107-112.
- Gheorghită, Nicolae, *The Byzantine Chant in the Romanian Principalities during the Phanariot Period (1711 – 1821)*, in: *Studia Universitatis Babeș-Bolyai, Musica*, LIV, 1, 2009 (p. 39-82)
<http://www.studia.ubbcluj.ro/download/pdf/436.pdf>
- Ghișa, Lucian, *Aspects of the Vocal-Symphonic Genre*, in: *Studia UBB Musica*, LVI, 1, 2011 (p. 23-31)
<http://www.studia.ubbcluj.ro/download/pdf/610.pdf>
- Hîrlav-Maistorovici, Sanda, 'Despre un manuscris «pierdut»... și regăsit: *Oratoriul de Paști* de Paul Constantinescu (I)' ['On a «Lost»... and Found Manuscript: the *Easter Oratorio* by Paul Constantinescu (I)'], in *Axioma*, No. 7 (52), July 2004 and 'Despre... (II)', in: *Axioma*, No. 8 (53), August 2004.
- Ionașcu, Stelian, *Mărgăritarul ascuns în țarină... sau Pasărea Phoenix* ['The Buried Treasure... or The Phoenix'], in *Muzica*, No. 1, 2010, pp. 39-50.
- Ionașcu, Stelian, *Paul Constantinescu și muzica psaltică românească* ['Paul Constantinescu and Romanian Psalm Music'], Editura Institutului Biblic, Bucharest, 2005.
- Moisescu, Titus, *Monodia bizantină în gândirea unor muzicieni români* ['The Byzantine Monody in the Conception of Several Romanian Musicians'], Editura Muzicală, Bucharest, 1999.
- Țiplea Temeș, Bianca *The Annunciation in Paul Constantinescu's Christmas Oratorio: Musical and Iconographic Decoding*, in: *Studia Universitatis Babeș-Bolyai, Musica*, LV, 1, 2010 (p. 165-182)
<http://www.studia.ubbcluj.ro/download/pdf/526.pdf>
- Petrescu, Pr. I. D., *Patimile Domnului –Oratoriul de Paul Constantinescu și de Părintele I. D. Petrescu, Explicațiuni și textul cântat*, [*The Passion of Our Lord – Oratorio by Paul Constantinescu and Father I. D. Petrescu. Scores and explanations.*], Tipografia Cărților Bisericești, 1946.
- Teodorian, Valentin, *Pagini din viața muzicianului Nicolae Lungu. Scurtă monografie* ['Pages from the Life of Musician Nicolae Lungu. A Short Monography'], Holy-Prest, Bucharest, 1993.
- Tomescu, Vasile, *Paul Constantinescu*, Editura Muzicală, Bucharest, 1967.